1	H.866
2	Introduced by Committee on Judiciary
3	Date:
4	Subject: Judiciary; qualification of judges; judicial selection
5	Statement of purpose of bill as introduced: This bill proposes to require the
6	appointment and retention of Judicial Bureau hearing officers to follow the
7	same manner as for other judges, establish residency requirements for judicial
8	officers and criteria for judicial candidates, and to amend the judicial
9	nominating and selection process.
10 11	An act relating to qualifications of judicial officers and judicial selection and retention
12	It is hereby enacted by the General Assembly of the State of Vermont:
13	Sec. 1. 4 V.S.A. § 5 is amended to read:
14	§ 5. TERM OF JUSTICES
15	(a) The term of the justices Justices, except in case of an appointment to fill
16	a vacancy, shall be for a term of six years from and including April 1 in the
17	year of such appointment or retention under subsection $4(c)$ of this title. A
18	Justice shall be a resident of Vermont during his of her term. When a justice
19	Justice of the supreme court Supreme Court, who has sat at the hearing of a
20	cause, retires from office before such cause is decided, the justice Justice shall

1	remain a member of such court Court for the purpose of assisting in the
1	
2	decision thereof and of signing the entry order, provided that such service may
3	extend only to the following term of court Court. For such service, the justice
4	<u>Justice</u> shall receive a reasonable compensation to be fixed by the justices
5	<u>Justices</u> of such <u>court</u> and reasonable expenses while on office business.
6	* * *
7	Sec. 2. 4 V.S.A. § 71 is amended to read:
8	§ 71. APPOINTMENT AND TERM OF SUPERIOR <u>COURT</u> JUDGES
9	(a) There shall be 32 superior Superior Court judges, whose terms of office
10	shall, except in the case of an appointment to fill a vacancy or unexpired term,
11	begin on April 1 in the year of their appointment or retention, and continue for
12	six years. A Superior Court judge shall be a resident of Vermont during his or
13	her term.
14	***
15	Sec. 3. 4 V.S.A. § 461 is amended to read:
16	§ 461. OFFICE OF MAGISTRATE; JURISDICTION; SELECTION; TERM
17	* * *
18	(b) A magistrate shall be an attorney admitted to practice in Vermont with
19	at least four years of general law practice. Magistrates shall be nominated,
20	appointed, and confirmed in the manner of superior Superior Court judges.

1	(c)(1) Terms of office of magistrates, except in the case of an appointment
2	to fill a vacancy or unexpired term, shall be for a term of six years from and
3	including April 1 in the year of the magistrate's appointment or retention. $\underline{\mathbf{A}}$
4	magistrate shall be a resident of Vermont during his or her term. A magistrate
5	shall remain in office until a successor is appointed and qualified, unless
6	sooner removed for cause or unless he or she resigns.
7	* * *
8	Sec. 4. 4 V.S.A. § 601 is amended to read:
9	§ 601. JUDICIAL NOMINATING BOARD CREATED; COMPOSITION
10	(a) A Judicial Nominating Board is created for the nomination of Supreme
11	Court Justices, Superior Judges Court judges, Magistrates judges of the
12	Environmental Division of the Superior Court, magistrates, Judicial Bureau
13	hearing officers, the Chair of the Public Service Board, and members of the
14	Public Service Board.
15	(b) The Board shall consist of 11 members who shall be selected
16	as follows:
17	(1) The Governor shall appoint two members who are not attorneys
18	at law.
19	(2) The Senate shall elect three of its members, not all of whom shall be
20	members of the same party, and only one of whom may be an attorney at law.

1	(3) The House shall elect three of its members, not all of whom shall be
2	members of the same party, and only one of whom may be an attorney at law.
3	(4) Attorneys at law admitted to practice before the Supreme Court of
4	Vermont, and residing in the State, shall elect three of their number as
5	members of the Board. The Supreme Court shall regulate the manner of their
6	nomination and election.
7	(5) The members of the Board appointed by the Governor shall serve for
8	terms of two years and may serve for no more than three consecutive terms.
9	The members of the Board elected by the House and Senate shall serve for
10	terms of two years and may serve for no more than three consecutive terms.
11	The members of the Board elected by the attorneys at law shall serve for terms
12	of two years and may serve for no more than three consecutive terms. All
13	appointments or elections shall be between January 1 and February 1 of each
14	odd-numbered year, except to fill a vacancy. Members shall serve until their
15	successors are elected or appointed.
16	(6) The members shall elect their own chair who will serve for a term of
17	two years.
18	(c) Legislative members of the Board shall be entitled to perdiem
19	compensation and reimbursement for expenses in accordance with V.S.A.
20	§ 406. Members of the Board who are not otherwise compensated by their

employer shall be entitled to per diem compensation and reimbursement for

1	expenses in the same manner as ocara members are compensated under
2	32 V.S.A. § 1010. All compensation and reimbursement shall be paid from the
3	legislative appropriation.
4	(d) The Judicial Nominating Board shall adopt rules under 3 V.S.A.
5	chapter 25 which shall establish criteria and standards for the nomination of
6	qualified candidates for justices <u>Justices</u> of the Supreme court, superior <u>Court</u> ,
7	Superior judges, magnetrates, the Chair of the Public Service Board, and
8	members of the Public Service Board. The criteria and standards shall include
9	such factors as integrity, legal knowledge and ability, judicial temperament,
10	impartiality, health, experience, diligence, administrative and communicative
11	skills, social consciousness, and public service. The application form shall not
12	be included in the rules and may be developed and periodically revised at the
13	discretion of the Board.
14	(e) A quorum of the Board shall consist of eight members.
15	(f)(e) The board Board is authorized to use the staff and services of
16	appropriate state State agencies and departments as necessary to conduct
17	investigations of applicants, including the Office of Legislative Council for the
18	purpose of rulemaking.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

Sag	5	1	V	C	٨	S	602	i 0	omon	dad	to	road	

2	$\Delta \Omega \Omega$	DUTIES
0 1	1 1 / .	170 115.5

- Prior to submission of to the Governor the names of qualified candidates for justices Justices of the supreme court Supreme Court, superior Superior Court judges, judges of the Environmental Division of the Superior Court, magistrates Judicial Bureau hearing officers, the chair of the public service board Chair of the Public Service Board, and members of the public service board to the governor Public Service Board, the board Board shall submit to the court administrator of the supreme court Supreme Court a list of all candidates, and the administrator shall disclose to the board Board information solely about professional disciplinary action taken or pending concerning any candidate. <u>If candidates for the Public Service Board are</u> admitted to practice law in Vermont, the Nominating Board shall submit to the Court Administrator a list of those candidates, and he or she shall disclose to the Board information solely about professional disciplinary action taken or pending concerning such candidates. From the list of candidates presented, the judicial nominating board Judicial Nominating Board shall select by majority vote, provided that a quorum is present, qualified the best candidates for the position to be filled.
- (b) Whenever a vacancy occurs in the office of a supreme court justice or Supreme Court Justice, a superior judge Superior Court judge, a judge of the

Environmental Division of the Superior Court, a magistrate, a Judicial Bureau
hearing officer, and the Chair of the Public Service Board, or when an
incument does not declare that he or she will be a candidate to succeed
himself or herself, the judicial nominating board Judicial Nominating Board
shall submit to the governor Governor the names of as many persons as it
deems qualified best-qualified to be appointed to the office. There shall be
included in the qualifications for appointment that the person shall be an
attorney at law who has been engaged in the practice of law or a judge in the
state of Vermont for a period of at least five out of the ten years preceding
appointment, and with respect to a candidate for superior judge particular
consideration shall be given to the nature and extent of the candidate's trial
practice. In accordance with 30 V.S.A. § 3, whenever a vacancy occurs for a
member position on the Public Service Board, the Governor shall submit at
least five names of potential nominees to the Judicial Nominating Board for
review. The Judicial Nominating Board shall submit to the Governor the
names of candidates it deems best-qualified. The Judicial Nominating Board
shall submit to the Governor a summary of the qualification, and experience of
each candidate whose name is submitted to the Governor, together with any
further information relevant to the matter.
(c) All Except as provided in subsection (d) of this section, proceedings of
the board Board, including the names of candidates considered by the board

1	Board and information about any candidate submitted by the court
2	administrator or by any other source, shall be confidential.
3	(d) The following shall be public:
4	(1) operating procedures of the Board;
5	(2) standard application forms and any other forms used by the Board,
6	provided they do not contain personal information about a candidate or
7	confidential proceedings;
8	(3) all proceedings of the Board prior to the Board's receipt of the first
9	candidate's completed application form; and
10	(4) at the time the Board sends the names of the best-qualified
11	candidates to the Governor, the total number of applicants for the vacancy and
12	the total number of best-qualified candidates sent to the Governor.
13	(e) A candidate shall possess the following attributes:
14	(1) Integrity. A candidate shall possess demonstrated integrity.
15	(2) Legal knowledge and ability. A candidate shall possess a high
16	degree of knowledge of established legal principles and procedures, and have
17	demonstrated a high degree of ability to interpret and apply the law to specific
18	factual situations.
19	(3) Judicial temperament. A candidate shall possess a judicial
20	temperament, which includes common sense, compassion, decisiveness
21	firmness, humility, open-mindedness, tact, and patience.

1	(1) Importiality A condidate shall exhibit an ability to make judicial
2	determinations in a manner free of bias.
3	(5) Professional experience. Except as otherwise provided by this
4	subdivision, a candidate shall be an experienced lawyer who has practiced law
5	for at least ten years, and shall have practiced law in Vermont for at least five
6	out of the ten years preceding his or her application to the Board. However:
7	(A) A candidate for a magistrate or Judicial Bureau hearing officer
8	need only have practiced law for five years, but shall have practiced law in
9	Vermont for at least five out of the ten years immediately preceding his or her
10	application to the Board.
11	(B) A candidate for the position of Chair or member of the Public
12	Service Board shall not be required to be an attorney.
13	(6) Stamina. A candidate shall possess the physical and mental capacity
14	required by the position.
15	(7) Communication capability. A candidate shall possess demonstrated
16	oral and written capacities, with reasonable accommodations, required by
17	the position.
18	(8) Financial integrity. A candidate shall possess demonstrated
19	financial probity.
20	(9) Work ethic. A candidate shall demonstrate diligence.

1	(10) Vermont residency. A candidate for Supreme Court Justice, a
2	judge of the Superior Court, magistrate, or Judicial Bureau hearing officer shall
3	be a Vermont resident for at least one year prior to application to the Board. A
4	candidate for Chair or member of the Public Service Board shall not be
5	required to be a Vermont resident.
6	(11) Administrative capabilities. A candidate shall demonstrate
7	management and organizational skills or experience required by the position.
8	(f) Factors that should be given due consideration by the Board, but are not
9	required of a candidate, include:
10	(1) public and community vervice;
11	(2) judicial experience in Vermont;
12	(3) for Superior Court, the nature and extent of the candidate's
13	courtroom experience;
14	(4) for judge of the Environmental Division of the Superior Court,
15	experience and expertise in environmental and zoning law; and
16	(5) for the Public Service Board Chair and Public Service Board
17	members, experience and expertise in utilities regulation.

1	Sec. 6. 4 V.S.A. § 603 is amended to read:
2	§ 603. APPOINTMENT OF JUSTICES, JUDGES, MAGISTRATES,
3	JUDICIAL BUREAU HEARING OFFICERS, PUBLIC SERVICE
4	BOARD CHAIRS, AND MEMBERS
5	Whenever the governor Governor appoints a supreme court justice Supreme
6	Court Justice, a superior judge Superior Court judge, a judge of the
7	Environmental Division of the Superior Court, a magistrate, Judicial Bureau
8	hearing officer, a chair of the public service board Chair of the Public Service
9	Board, or a member of the public service board Public Service Board, he or she
10	shall select from the list of names of qualified persons submitted by the judicial
11	nominating board Judicial Nominating Board pursuant to law. The names of
12	candidates submitted and not selected shall remain confidential. If the
13	Governor does not select a candidate from the list of names of qualified
14	candidates submitted by the Board, the Board shall repeat the nomination
15	process in accordance with this chapter. Application during the second or
16	subsequent round of candidate selection for a vacancy shall be limited to
17	persons who did not previously apply for that particular vacancy. The names
18	of qualified candidates previously submitted to the Governor, but not chosen
19	by the Governor, shall be resubmitted to the Governor along with the names of
20	the newly selected candidates.

Sac. 7	7 / 1	V C	٨	2	600	:.	amanda	ad to	road.
			-			-			

§ 608. FUNCTIONS

- (a) Declarations submitted to the general assembly General Assembly by a supreme court justice Supreme Court Justice under subsection 4(c) of this title, by a superior court Superior Court judge under subsection 71(b) of this title, or by a magistrate under subsection 461(c) of this title, or a Judicial Bureau hearing officer shall be referred immediately to the joint committee on judicial retention Joint Committee on Judicial Retention. The declarations shall be accompanied by a supporting statement by the judge, the justice Justice, or the magistrate seeking retention. In the case of a superior court Superior Court judge or magistrate, the declaration shall also be accompanied by information on the next succeeding rotation schedule for the judge seeking retention.
- (b) The joint committee Joint Committee responsible for the recommendation of retention shall review the candidacies of those justices, superior Justices, Superior judges, and magistrates desiring to succeed themselves. In conducting its review, the committee Committee shall evaluate judicial performance, including but not limited to such factors as integrity, judicial temperament, impartiality, health, diligence, legal knowledge and ability, and administrative and communicative skills.
- (c) For the purpose of receiving information and hearing testimony, the <u>joint committee</u> responsible for the recommendation of

retention shall hold hearings which, if possible, shall not commence until the
general assembly General Assembly is in session. Information obtained under
subsection 607(c) of this title, shall be confidential until the committee
Committee commences its hearings under this subsection.
(d) A judge, a justice Justice, or a magistrate seeking retention has the righ
to present oral or written testimony to the committee Committee relative to hi
or her retention, may be represented by counsel, and may present witnesses to
testify in his or her behalf. Copies of written comments received by the
committee Committee shall be forwarded to the judge, the justice Justice, or
the magistrate. A judge, a justice Justice, or a magistrate seeking retention ha
the right to a reasonable time period to prepare and present to the committee
Committee a response to any testimony or written complaint adverse to his or
her retention and has the right to be present during any public hearing
conducted by the committee <u>Committee</u> .
(e) On or before the tenth Thursday after the convening of each biennial
and adjourned session, the committee Committee shall report to the general
assembly General Assembly its recommendation whether the candidates
should continue in office, with any amplifying information which it may deen

appropriate, in order that the general assembly General Assembly may

discharge its obligation under section 34 of Chapter II of the Vermont

constitution Constitution of the State of Vermont.

1	(f) In the performance of its official functions, the joint committee on
1	(1) In the performance of its official functions, the joint committee on
2	judicial retention Joint Committee on Judicial Retention may by a majority
3	vote of its membership issue subpoenas to compel the attendance of witnesses
4	to testify under oath and to produce documents.
5	(g) The votes on retention under subsections 4(c), 71(b), and 461(c) of this
6	title shall be conducted in one joint assembly of the general assembly General
7	Assembly, except that in the event that the joint committee Joint Committee
8	reports to the general assembly General Assembly that it is not able to make its
9	recommendation on a particular justice Justice, judge, or magistrate under
10	subsection (b) of this section on or before the date set for such joint assembly,
11	the vote on such individual or individuals shall be deferred to a subsequent
12	joint assembly, and separate ballots shall be used despite any other statutory
13	provisions relating to the votes on retention.
14	Sec. 8. 4 V.S.A. § 1001 is amended to read:
15	§ 1001. ENVIRONMENTAL DIVISION
16	***
17	(d) An environmental A judge of the Environmental Division of the
18	Superior Court shall be appointed on April 1, for a term of six years or the
19	unexpired portion thereof. A judge of the Environmental Division of the
20	Superior Court shall be a resident of Vermont during his or her term.
21	* * *

1	Sec. 9. 4 V.S.A. § 1104 is amended to read:
2	§ N04. APPOINTMENT OF HEARING OFFICERS
3	(a) The administrative judge shall appoint members of the Vermont bar to
4	serve as hearing officers to hear cases. Hearing officers shall be subject to the
5	Code of Judicial Conduct There shall be hearing officers who shall hear cases
6	in the Judicial Buleau, whose terms of office shall, except in the case of an
7	appointment to fill a vacancy or unexpired term, begin on April 1 in the year of
8	their appointment or retention, and continue for six years.
9	(b) A hearing officer may file in the Office of Secretary of State, on or
10	before September 1 of the year preceding the expiration of the term for which
11	he or she was appointed or retained, a declaration that he or she will be a
12	candidate for retention. However, a hearing officer appointed and having
13	taken the oath of office after September 1 of the year preceding the expiration
14	of the term of office shall automatically be a candidate for retention without
15	filing notice. When a hearing officer files such a declaration, his or her name
16	shall be submitted to the General Assembly for a vote of retention. The
17	General Assembly shall vote upon one ballot on the question "Shall the
18	following hearing officers be retained in office?" The names of the hearing
19	officers shall be listed followed by "Yes No ." If a majority of those
20	voting on the question vote against retention, upon expiration of the term of
21	office a vacancy shall exist which shall be filled by appointment in accordance

1	with the Constitution and chapter 15 of this title; if the majority vote is in favor-
2	of retention, the hearing officer shall, unless removed for cause, remain in
3	office for another term and, at its end, shall be eligible for retention in office in
4	the manner herein prescribed.
5	(c) The Court Administrator shall notify the Secretary of State whenever a
6	hearing officer is appointed and takes the oath of office after September 1 of
7	the year preceding the expiration of the term of office to which the hearing
8	officer has succeeded, thereby resulting in automatic notification of an
9	intention to continue in office. Whenever a hearing officer files a declaration
10	under subsection (b) of this section or notification occurs automatically, the
11	Secretary of State shall notify the President of the Senate, the Speaker of the
12	House, and the Office of Legislative Council.
13	(d) A hearing officer shall remain in office until a successor is appointed
14	and qualified, unless sooner removed for cause or unless he or she resigns.
15	Sec. 10. EFFECTIVE DATE
16	This act shall take effect on passage.
	Sec. 1. 4 V.S.A. § 601 is amended to read:
	§ 601. JUDICIAL NOMINATING BOARD CREATED; COMPOSITION

(b) The Board shall consist of 11 members who shall be selected as follows:

* * *

(5) The members of the Board appointed by the Governor shall serve for terms of two years and may serve for no more than three consecutive terms. The members of the Board elected by the House and Senate shall serve for terms of two years and may serve for no more than three consecutive terms. The members of the Board elected by the attorneys at law shall serve for terms of two years and may serve for no more than three consecutive terms. All appointments or elections shall be between January 1 and February 1 of each odd-numbered year, except to fill a vacancy. Members shall serve until their successors are elected or appointed.

* * *

(d) The Judicial Nominating Board shall adopt rules under 3 V.S.A. chapter 25 which shall establish criteria and standards for the nomination of qualified candidates for justices Justices of the Supreme court, superior Court, Superior judges, magistrates, the Chair of the Public Service Board, and members of the Public Service Board. The criteria and standards shall include such factors as integrity, legal knowledge and ability, judicial temperament, impartiality, health, experience, diligence, administrative and communicative skills, social consciousness, and public service. The application form shall not be included in the rules and may be developed and periodically revised at the discretion of the Board.

- (e) A quorum of the Board shall consist of eight members.
- (f) The board Board is authorized to use the staff and services of appropriate state State agencies and departments as necessary to conduct investigations of applicants. The Office of Legislative Council shall assist the Board for the purpose of rulemaking.

Sec. 2. 4 V.S.A. § 602 is amended to read:

§ 602. DUTIES

(a)(1) Prior to submission of submitting to the Governor the names of qualified candidates for justices Justices of the supreme court Supreme Court, superior Superior Court judges, magistrates, the chair of the public service board Chair of the Public Service Board, and members of the public service board to the governor Public Service Board, the board Board shall submit to the court administrator Court Administrator of the supreme court Supreme Court a list of all candidates, and the administrator shall disclose to the board Board information solely about professional disciplinary action taken or pending concerning any candidate. If candidates for the Public Service Board are admitted to practice law in Vermont, the Nominating Board shall submit to the Court Administrator a list of those candidates, and he or she shall disclose to the Board information solely about professional disciplinary action taken or pending concerning such candidates.

- (2) From the list of candidates presented, the judicial nominating board

 Judicial Nominating Board shall select by majority vote, provided that a

 quorum is present, qualified well-qualified candidates for the position to be

 filled.
- (b) Whenever a vacancy occurs in the office of a supreme court justice or Supreme Court Justice, a superior judge Superior judge, a magistrate, or the Chair of the Public Service Board, or when an incumbent does not declare that he or she will be a candidate to succeed himself or herself, the judicial nominating board Judicial Nominating Board shall submit to the governor Governor the names of as many persons as it deems qualified well qualified to be appointed to the office. There shall be included in the qualifications for appointment that the person shall be an attorney at law who has been engaged in the practice of law or a judge in the state of Vermont for a period of at least five out of the ten years preceding appointment, and with respect to a candidate for superior judge particular consideration shall be given to the nature and extent of the candidate's trial practice. In accordance with 30 V.S.A. § 3, whenever a vacancy occurs for a member position on the Public Service Board, the Governor shall submit at least five names of potential nominees to the Judicial Nominating Board for review. The Judicial Nominating Board shall submit to the Governor the names of candidates it deems well qualified. The Judicial Nominating Board shall submit to the

Governor a summary of the qualifications and experience of each candidate whose name is submitted to the Governor, together with any further information relevant to the matter.

- (c) All Except as provided in subsection (d) of this section, proceedings of the board Board, including the names of candidates considered by the board Board and information about any candidate submitted by the court administrator Court Administrator or by any other source, shall be confidential.
 - (d) The following shall be public:
 - (1) operating procedures of the Board;
- (2) standard application forms and any other forms used by the Board, provided they do not contain personal information about a candidate or confidential proceedings;
- (3) all proceedings of the Board prior to the Board's receipt of the first candidate's completed application form; and
- (4) at the time the Board sends the names of the candidates to the Governor, the total number of applicants for the vacancy and the total number of candidates sent to the Governor.
 - (e) A person shall be eligible as a candidate if, upon application:
- (1) The person is a Vermont resident and admitted to practice law in Vermont.

- (2) Except as otherwise provided by this subdivision, the person is an experienced lawyer who has practiced law for at least ten years, and has practiced law in Vermont for at least five out of the ten years preceding his or her application to the Board. However:
- (A) A candidate for magistrate need only have practiced law for five years, but shall have practiced law in Vermont for at least five out of the ten years immediately preceding his or her application to the Board.
- (B) A candidate for the position of Chair or member of the Public Service Board shall not be required to be an attorney.
 - (f) A candidate shall possess the following attributes:
 - (1) Integrity. A candidate shall possess demonstrated integrity.
- (2) Legal knowledge and ability. A candidate shall possess a high degree of knowledge of established legal principles and procedures, and have demonstrated a high degree of ability to interpret and apply the law to specific factual situations.
- (3) Judicial temperament. A candidate shall possess a judicial temperament, which includes common sense, compassion, decisiveness, firmness, humility, open-mindedness, tact, and patience.
- (4) Impartiality. A candidate shall exhibit an ability to make judicial determinations in a manner free of bias.

- (5) Communication capability. A candidate shall possess demonstrated oral and written capacities, with reasonable accommodations, required by the position.
- (6) Financial integrity. A candidate shall possess demonstrated financial probity.
 - (7) Work ethic. A candidate shall demonstrate diligence.
- (8) Administrative capabilities. A candidate shall demonstrate management and organizational skills or experience required by the position.
- (g) Factors that should be given due consideration by the Board, but are not required of a candidate, include:
 - (1) public and community service;
 - (2) judicial experience in Vermont;
- (3) for Superior Court, the nature and extent of the candidate's courtroom experience; and
- (4) for judge of the Environmental Division of the Superior Court, experience and expertise in environmental and zoning law.

Sec. 3. EFFECTIVE DATE

This act shall take effect on passage.